

Table of Contents

Executive Summary iii

List of Acronyms xvi

List of Tables xx

List of Figures xxvii

Chapter I: Introduction I-1

A. Background Information for Today’s Final Rule I-1

B. Overview of the Final Rule I-2

1. Vehicle Emission Standards I-3

2. Gasoline Sulfur Standards I-4

Chapter II: Health and Welfare Concerns II-1

A. Health and Welfare Effects of Ozone II-1

B. Health and Welfare Effects of Particulate Matter II-4

C. Carbon Monoxide II-6

D. Visibility and Regional Haze II-7

Chapter II. References II-9

Chapter III: Environmental Impact III-1

A. Inventory Impacts of Tier 2/Sulfur III-1

1. NOx III-4

a. Light-Duty NOx Trends Without Tier 2/Sulfur III-4

b. NOx Reductions Due To Tier 2/Sulfur III-10

2. VOC III-16

a. Light-Duty VOC Trends Without Tier 2/Sulfur III-16

b. VOC Reductions Due To Tier 2/Sulfur III-21

3. SOx III-27

a. Light-Duty SOx Trends Without Sulfur Control III-27

b. SOx Reductions Due To Sulfur Control III-29

4. Particulate Matter III-30

a. “No Growth” Diesel Sales Scenario III-31

b. “Increased Growth” Sales Scenario III-35

B. Ozone: Baseline Nonattainment and Program Impacts III-41

1. General Description of the EPA Ozone Modeling Used In This

Tier 2/Sulfur Regulatory Impact Analysis - December 1999

	Rulemaking	III-41
	a. Modeling Methodology	III-41
	b. Determining Need for Additional Emissions Reductions ...	III-45
2.	Ozone Reductions Expected from this Rule	III-46
3.	Ozone Modeling and Analysis in 1-Hour State Implementation Plan	
	Submittals and Other Local Ozone Modeling	III-47
	a. Overview	III-47
	b. CAA Requirements and EPA Policy	III-51
	c. Local Ozone Modeling in SIP Submissions	III-53
	d. Conclusions from the Local Modeling in SIP Submittals ...	III-56
	e. Other Local Ozone Modeling	III-58
	f. Need for Further Reductions in Emissions in Order to Attain and	
	Maintain	III-59
C.	Particulate Matter and Visibility/Regional Haze	III-61
1.	Particulate Matter	III-61
	a. Background on Particulate Matter	III-61
	b. PM ₁₀ Role of Cars and Light Trucks	III-63
	c. Current PM ₁₀ Nonattainment	III-67
	d. Future Nonattainment	III-68
	e. Diesel PM	III-73
	f. Reductions In Ambient PM	III-80
2.	Visibility/Regional Haze	III-81
D.	Air Toxics	III-82
1.	Health Effects	III-82
	a. Benzene	III-83
	b. 1,3-Butadiene	III-84
	c. Formaldehyde	III-85
	d. Acetaldehyde	III-87
	e. Diesel Particulate Matter	III-87
2.	Assessment of Emissions and Exposure	III-89
	a. Emissions Modeling	III-90
	b. Nationwide Toxic Emissions Estimates – Baseline Scenario	III-96
	c. Exposure – Baseline Scenario	III-97
	d. Impact of Potential Vehicle and Fuel Controls	III-99
E.	Carbon Monoxide	III-103
	Chapter III References	III-106
	Chapter IV: Technological Feasibility	IV-1
A.	Feasibility of Tier 2 Exhaust Emission Standards for Vehicles	IV-1
1.	NMOG and NOx Emissions from Gasoline-Fueled Vehicles	IV-1
	a. Technology Description	IV-2

Table of Contents

	b.	Data Supporting Tier 2 Technical Feasibility	IV-14
	c.	Lean-Burn Technology	IV-32
2.		CO Emissions from Gasoline Fueled Vehicles	IV-33
3.		Formaldehyde Emissions from Gasoline Fueled Vehicles	IV-33
4.		Evaporative Emissions	IV-34
5.		Diesel Vehicles	IV-35
B.		Feasibility of Removing Sulfur from Gasoline	IV-39
	1.	Source of Gasoline Sulfur	IV-39
	2.	Current Levels of Sulfur in Gasoline	IV-40
	3.	Feasibility of Meeting the Final Gasoline Sulfur Standards	IV-42
	4.	Meeting a Low Sulfur Gasoline Standard	IV-43
		a. Background	IV-43
		b. FCC Feed Hydrotreating	IV-46
		c. FCC Gasoline Hydrotreating	IV-47
	5.	Expected Desulfurization Technology to be Used by Refiners	IV-53
	6.	Feasibility for a Low Gasoline Sulfur Standard in 2004	IV-54
	7.	Phase In of Compliance with the Proposed Sulfur Standards and Early Credit Generation	IV-58
Chapter IV References			IV-66
Chapter V: Economic Impact			V-1
A.		Impact of Tier 2 Standards on Vehicle Costs	V-1
	1.	Manufacturer Costs for Tier 2 Vehicles	V-1
		a. Methodology	V-1
		b. Hardware Costs for Exhaust Emissions Control	V-4
		c. Hardware Costs for Evaporative Emissions Control	V-17
		d. Assembly Costs	V-19
		e. Development and Capital Costs	V-20
		f. Total Near-term and Long-term Manufacturer Costs	V-22
	2.	Tier 2 Vehicle Consumer Costs	V-26
	3.	Annual Total Nationwide Costs for Tier 2 Vehicles	V-27
		a. Overview of Nationwide Vehicle Costs	V-27
		b. Methodology	V-28
		c. Estimates of Total Nationwide Vehicle Costs by Vehicle Class	V-29
B.		Gasoline Desulfurization Costs	V-38
	1.	Overview of Changes Since the NPRM	V-39
	2.	Cost Estimation Methodology	V-41
		a. Technology and Cost Inputs	V-41
		b. Capital Costs	V-46
		c. Fixed Operating Cost	V-48

Tier 2/Sulfur Regulatory Impact Analysis - December 1999

	d.	Variable Operating Cost	V-48
	e.	Determination of Blendstock Sulfur Levels	V-50
	f.	Phase-In Desulfurization	V-58
	g.	Decreasing Costs in Future Years	V-59
3		The Cost of Desulfurizing Gasoline	V-60
	a.	EPA Costs	V-60
	b.	Other Low Sulfur Cost Studies	V-64
	c.	Cost of Meeting a 5 ppm Averaging Standard	V-70
4.		Other Effects of This Program	V-74
	a.	Effect of the Cap Standard	V-74
	b.	Other Effects on the Refining Industry	V-76
5.		Per Vehicle Life-Cycle Fuel Costs	V-80
6.		Aggregate Annual Fuel Costs	V-83
	a.	Methodology	V-84
	b.	Explanation of Results	V-85
C.		Combined Vehicle and Fuel Costs	V-89
	1.	Combined Costs Per Vehicle	V-89
	2.	Combined Total Annual Nationwide Costs	V-91
Chapter V References			V-92
Chapter VI: Cost-Effectiveness			VI-1
A.		Overview of the Analysis	VI-1
	1.	Temporal and Geographic Applicability	VI-2
	2.	Baselines	VI-3
B.		Costs	VI-5
	1.	Near and Long-Term Cost Accounting	VI-5
	2.	Vehicle and Fuel Costs	VI-6
	3.	Cost Crediting for PM and SO ₂	VI-6
C.		Emission Reductions	VI-8
	1.	NO _x and NMHC	VI-9
	2.	Irreversibility	VI-12
	3.	Primary Particulate Matter	VI-15
	4.	Sulfur Dioxide	VI-16
D.		Aggregate Cost-Effectiveness	VI-17
E.		Results	VI-17
APPENDIX VI-A : Discounted Lifetime Tonnage Values for Exhaust Emissions			VI-22
APPENDIX VI-B : Discounted Lifetime Tonnage Values for Evaporative Emissions ..			VI-26
APPENDIX VI-C : Aggregate Annual Tons and Costs			VI-27

Table of Contents

Chapter VI. References	VI-28
Chapter VII: Benefit-Cost Analysis	VII-1
A. Emissions	VII-7
B. Air Quality Impacts	VII-8
1. Ozone Air Quality Estimates	VII-10
a. Modeling Domain	VII-10
b. Simulation Periods	VII-11
c. Converting UAM-V Outputs to Full-Season Profiles for Benefits Analysis	VII-13
d. Ozone Air Quality Results	VII-13
2. PM Air Quality Estimates	VII-16
a. Development of the S-R Matrix	VII-16
b. Fugitive Dust Adjustment Factor	VII-17
c. Normalizing S-R Matrix Results to Observed Data	VII-18
d. PM Air Quality Results	VII-19
3. Visibility Degradation Estimates	VII-21
4. Nitrogen Deposition Estimates	VII-24
C. Benefit Analysis	VII-25
1. Methods for Estimating Benefits from Air Quality Improvements ..	VII-25
2. Methods for Describing Uncertainty	VII-28
a. Unquantifiable Environmental Benefits and Costs	VII-32
b. Projected Population and Income Growth	VII-33
D. Assessment of Human Health Benefits	VII-33
1. Estimating Baseline Incidences for Health Effects	VII-34
2. Accounting for Potential Health Effect Thresholds	VII-34
3. Quantifying and Valuing Individual Health Endpoints	VII-35
a. Premature Mortality: Quantification	VII-40
b. Premature Mortality: Valuation	VII-42
c. Chronic Bronchitis: Quantification	VII-46
d. Chronic Bronchitis: Valuation	VII-47
e. Chronic Asthma: Quantification	VII-47
f. Chronic Asthma: Valuation	VII-48
g. Hospital Admissions: Quantification	VII-49
h. Hospital Admissions: Valuation	VII-49
i. Other Health Effects: Quantification	VII-50
j. Other Health Effects: Valuation	VII-53
k. Lost Worker Productivity: Quantification and Valuation ..	VII-53
l. Estimated Reductions in Incidences of Health Endpoints and Associated Monetary Values	VII-53
E. Assessment of Human Welfare Benefits	VII-56
1. Visibility Benefits	VII-56

Tier 2/Sulfur Regulatory Impact Analysis - December 1999

2.	Agricultural and Forestry Benefits	VII-60	
3.	Benefits from Reductions in Materials Damage	VII-62	
4.	Benefits from Reduced Ecosystem Damage	VII-62	
5.	Estimated Values for Welfare Endpoints	VII-65	
F.	Total Benefits	VII-66	
G.	Summary of Cost Results	VII-76	
I.	Comparison of Costs and Benefits	VII-78	
H.	References	VII-80	
Appendix VII-A			
	Supplementary Benefit Estimates and Sensitivity Analyses of Key Parameters in the Benefits Analysis	VII-89	
A.	Introduction and Overview	VII-89	
B.	Supplementary Benefit Estimates	VII-89	
C.	Sensitivity Analyses	VII-92	
1.	Alternative Lag Structures	VII-92	
2.	PM Health Effect Threshold	VII-94	
D.	References	VII-97	
Chapter VIII: Regulatory Flexibility			VIII-1
A.	Requirements of the Regulatory Flexibility Act	VIII-1	
B.	Description of Affected Entities	VIII-2	
1.	Small Refiners	VIII-3	
2.	Small Petroleum Marketers	VIII-4	
3.	Small Certifiers of Covered Vehicles	VIII-4	
C.	Projected Costs of the Proposed Gasoline Sulfur Standards	VIII-5	
D.	The Types and Number of Small Entities to Which the Proposed Rule Would Apply	VIII-5	
E.	Projected Reporting, Recordkeeping, and Other Compliance Requirements of the Proposed Rule	VIII-6	
F.	Other Relevant Federal Rules Which May Duplicate, Overlap, or Conflict with the Proposed Rule	VIII-7	
G.	Regulatory Alternatives	VIII-7	
1.	Small Refiner Interim Sulfur Standards	VIII-7	
a.	Extensions Beyond 2007 for Qualifying Small Refiners	VIII-9	
b.	Compliance Plans for Demonstrating a Commitment to Produce Low Sulfur Gasoline	VIII-10	
2.	Small Certifiers of Covered Vehicles	VIII-11	
Chapter VIII. References			VIII-13

Table of Contents

Appendix A: 47-State and Four-Cities Emission Inventories	A-1
Appendix B: Evidence Supporting the Irreversibility of Sulfur's Emission Impact	B-1
A. Exhaust Emission Sensitivity to Sulfur Content	B-2
B. Theory Supporting the Reversibility and Irreversibility of Sulfur's Emission Impact	B-9
C. Results of Sulfur Irreversibility Test Programs	B-12
1. Pre-SFTP LEVs	B-12
a. Coordinating Research Council (CRC) Sulfur Irreversibility Program	B-12
b. American Petroleum Institute Sulfur Irreversibility Program ..	B-14
c. Ford Sulfur Irreversibility Program	B-20
d. EPA Sulfur Irreversibility Test Program	B-21
e. ATL Sulfur Irreversibility Program	B-22
f. Irreversibility for Long-Term Sulfur Exposure	B-23
2. SFTP-compliant LEV and Tier 2 vehicles	B-24
a. DaimlerChrysler Sulfur Irreversibility Program	B-24
b. EPA Sulfur Reversibility Program	B-25
c. ATL Sulfur Reversibility Program	B-26
D. Criteria for Evaluating Sulfur Reversibility Data	B-26
E. Projected Levels of Sulfur Irreversibility In-Use	B-29
1. Pre-SFTP Vehicles	B-29
2. SFTP-Compliant LEV and Tier 2 vehicles	B-30
Appendix C: Refinery Energy and Global Warming Impacts and Emissions	C-1
Appendix D: EPA's Legal Authority for Proposing Gasoline Sulfur Controls	D-1
A. EPA's Current Regulatory Requirements for Gasoline	D-1
B. How the Gasoline Sulfur Control Program Meets the CAA Section 211(c) Criteria	D-2
1. Health and Welfare Concerns of Air Pollution Caused by Sulfur in Gasoline	D-2
2. Impact of Gasoline Sulfur Emission Products on Emission Control Systems	D-4
3. Sulfur Levels that Tier 2 Vehicles Can Tolerate	D-5
4. Sulfur Sensitivity of Other Catalysts	D-7
5. Effect of Gasoline Sulfur Control on the Use of Other Fuels or Fuel Additives	D-9